

EDUCATION, YOUTH & CULTURE OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

Date of Meeting	Thursday 2 nd February, 2023
Report Subject	Music Service Theatr Clwyd
Cabinet Member	Leader of the Council and Cabinet Member for Education and the Welsh Language
Report Author	Chief Officer (Education and Youth)
Type of Report	Operational

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report provides an update and overview of Theatr Clwyd Music Trust following its first 18 months of delivery, as set against agreed principles of transfer in 2019 from the Education Portfolio within the Council to Theatr Clwyd. This transfer was designed to initially protect, but also to further enhance, the delivery of music education services to the children and young people of Flintshire which was under threat due to increasing financial pressures on the Council.

The Theatr Clwyd Music Trust is now well established and despite the challenges of the COVID-19 pandemic, is making steady progress in achieving its ambitious business plan priorities.

The Trust is one of the key delivery mechanisms for the National Plan for Music Education which was established by Welsh Government in 2022. This ensures children and young people in Flintshire benefit from this important national initiative regardless of their financial circumstances.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1	That members note the developments of the Theatr Clwyd Music Trust, since its creation, including the challenges posed by the COVID-19 pandemic.
2	That members are assured that the Theatr Clwyd Music Trust is positively and actively delivering on the National Music Service Plan for the benefit of children and young people in Flintshire.

REPORT DETAILS

1.00	EXPLAINING THE THEATR CLWYD MUSIC SERVICE TRUST							
1.01	<p><u>Background</u></p> <p>Flintshire Music Service, as a discretionary service within the Education Portfolio, had been under increasing financial pressure due to reductions in funding for local government and increasing pressures for the delivery of statutory services. The Music Service had a complex operating and financial method, non-equitable charging and lesson structure for both schools and parents which resulted in the cost of the tuition and charge to schools and parents not being equitable cross the county. There was also a heavy administrative burden on schools.</p>							
1.02	<p>As a benchmark, prior to the change of service model, income to the Music Service in 2019-20 via schools was £638k, of which £233k was notionally delegated funding agreed with the Headteacher Federations. The balance of £405k was paid by schools through parental contributions and school funds. There was no certainty about the level contributed by families for their lessons and the charges were not equitable across the authority.</p>							
1.03	<p>During 2018/2019, whilst Theatr Clwyd was still part of Flintshire County Council, significant work was done with the teaching unions representing the workforce within the Flintshire Music Service to TUPE them onto the Theatr Clwyd House Agreement. This offered more flexibility of working arrangements than was possible under the national model of School Teachers' Pay and Conditions. This flexibility provided greater opportunities to generate income to make the Music Service more sustainable. Without this approach there was a significant risk that the provision of music services to schools would have to cease.</p>							
1.04	<p>This new model was adopted and agreed at the Council's School Budget Forum in late 2019. This was then included in the 2021 transfer of Theatr Clwyd into an independent charitable trust and trading group, with the creation of a dedicated organisation called Theatr Clwyd Music Trust.</p> <p>The new model was agreed based on the following principles:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High Quality Music Service • Value for money • Equitable and transparent charging structure • Reduce financial and administrative burden from schools • Increased choice for schools and parents 							
1.05	<p>The headline summary of the changes are detailed below:</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th style="text-align: left;">Flintshire Music Service</th> <th style="text-align: left;">Theatr Clwyd Music</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Schools charged £53.20 per hour</td> <td>Schools Charged £38.20 per hour</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Notional delegation of £235k in lieu of tuition hours</td> <td>'Top slice' £250k to Theatr Clwyd</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Flintshire Music Service	Theatr Clwyd Music	Schools charged £53.20 per hour	Schools Charged £38.20 per hour	Notional delegation of £235k in lieu of tuition hours	'Top slice' £250k to Theatr Clwyd
Flintshire Music Service	Theatr Clwyd Music							
Schools charged £53.20 per hour	Schools Charged £38.20 per hour							
Notional delegation of £235k in lieu of tuition hours	'Top slice' £250k to Theatr Clwyd							

	Net cost to school estimated at £200k	Net cost to schools estimated at £150k
	One tuition choice Small group lesson of 30 minutes (numbers in group ranged from 2 to 9)	Four different tuition choices Group size less with two or three participants or individual lessons of 20 or 30 minutes
	Recommend Annual charge for families £132 per year equivalent to £4.40 per lesson The charging varied from school to school	Annual Charges for families £160 or £4.70 per lesson (3 per group, 30 mins) £245 or £7.20 per lesson (2 per group, 30 mins) £380 or £11.18 per lesson (Ind 20 mins) £570 or £16.76 per lesson (Ind 30 mins)
	Schools responsible for collating lesson requests and collecting monies for lessons	Theatr Clwyd responsible for collating lesson requests and collecting all monies
	Minimum 30 lessons per year	Set number of 34 lessons per year
	<p>Additionally:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Schools agreed to charge families the same price across lessons in line with Music Service guidance • Schools agreed to continue to fund eFSM learners wishing to participate in music lessons. <p>There is an initial five-year commitment to this arrangement to ensure security is given to the service during period of change and improvement.</p>	
1.06	<p>Over the next five years, Theatr Clwyd's Music Trust aims to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maintain and improve the quality and options of the Music Service • Continue to reduce costs for schools • Continue to reduce costs for parents • Increase choice for schools and parents • Ensure all families are charged the same across the county • Work towards a cost neutral model for schools • Reduce administrative burden on schools 	
1.07	<p><u>The Impact of the COVID-19 Pandemic</u></p> <p>COVID-19 delayed the implementation of the new model. During the remainder of the 2019-2020 academic year, learners were offered to</p>	

	<p>continue their lessons free of charge; refunds for schools and families were passed onto schools. Lessons were a mixture of pre-recorded and live interactive online sessions.</p> <p>The academic year 2020-2021 was delivered purely online and the music teachers delivered from home so as not to contribute to the spread of the virus and pose further risks to schools. Numbers learning an instrument dipped below 400 despite lessons being offered at lower prices than previously and with no charge to schools. The significant losses to income for the Music Trust were recovered via the Welsh Government Local Government Hardship Fund.</p>
1.08	<p><u>September 2021</u></p> <p>A whole year after the planned implementation, delivery returned to schools with the new model. School engagement in summer 2020 was aimed at re-informing schools of the new model and asking for their help in sharing the new offer for pupils. New software was introduced which facilitated school and family communications, and this allowed us to lessen the administrative burden for schools, which had been significant. This was welcomed by schools.</p> <p>The service was fully operationally albeit with comprehensive risk assessments and mitigations due to ongoing COVID-19 guidance, but the positive impact on learner numbers can clearly be seen. During the first term numbers of learners steadily rose, and total charges to schools during this year (not including eFSM, GCSE, and A-level tuition) was reduced to £55k.</p> <p>The reduction in learner numbers during the 2020-21 academic year was most keenly felt in Connah's Quay, Holywell and Saltney. Engagement with eFSM learners across the authority was still considerably lower than in 2019/20 with just 42 receiving small group and individual lessons. Numbers of young people having small group and individual lessons was 975 with a further 105 receiving whole class tuition in Sealand, St Mary's (Flint) and Ysgol Mornant. There were 5 after school ensembles meeting weekly with 65 participants.</p>
1.09	<p><u>September 2022</u></p> <p>The second year of the new model has seen an increase of 10% in numbers receiving small group and individual lessons and the number receiving whole class experiences has remained at 105. In September 2022 the number of eFSM learners receiving small group and individual lessons was 76 which is almost double the number of eFSM learners last year, but is still less than 10% of total number of young people having music lessons. This does not compare favourably with the percentage numbers of pupils eligible for free school meals across Flintshire which is closer to 20%. There will be an ongoing focus with schools to increase the number of eFSM learners being able to access music tuition, which can be legitimately funded through the Pupil Development Grant funding schools receive directly for pupils entitled to Free School Meals. The number of ensembles has increased to 8 to include beginners and numbers</p>

	<p>participating are growing weekly. Currently, there are 81 participating in ensembles, an increase of 20% in 2021/22.</p> <p>The financial contribution from schools has increased to approximately £65k for the year, reflecting the increase in participation. School contributions are based on actual lessons given, rather than in the previous model where contributions were agreed and fixed at the beginning of the academic year. This ensures that schools' contributions reflect the actual tuition received. This fairer model is welcomed by schools.</p>																								
1.10	<p><u>Overview of Lessons and Pupil Numbers since 2020/21</u></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Year</th> <th>Lesson Delivery</th> <th>Number of learners (Small group and individual)</th> <th>Number of learners (whole class and First Experiences)</th> <th>Number of Learners in Ensembles</th> <th>Charges to schools</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>2020/21</td> <td>Online</td> <td>397</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2021/22</td> <td>In person</td> <td>975</td> <td>105</td> <td>65</td> <td>£55k</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2022/23</td> <td>In person</td> <td>1160</td> <td>800+</td> <td>81</td> <td>£65k</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Year	Lesson Delivery	Number of learners (Small group and individual)	Number of learners (whole class and First Experiences)	Number of Learners in Ensembles	Charges to schools	2020/21	Online	397	0	0	0	2021/22	In person	975	105	65	£55k	2022/23	In person	1160	800+	81	£65k
Year	Lesson Delivery	Number of learners (Small group and individual)	Number of learners (whole class and First Experiences)	Number of Learners in Ensembles	Charges to schools																				
2020/21	Online	397	0	0	0																				
2021/22	In person	975	105	65	£55k																				
2022/23	In person	1160	800+	81	£65k																				
1.11	<p><u>Winter of Wellbeing Funding 2021-22</u></p> <p>As a response to the pandemic, Welsh Government made grant funding available to councils under the banner of 'Winter of Wellbeing' to provide a range of activities for children and young people to support their emotional and physical health. Some of this funding was directed toward music services. Theatr Clwyd Music Trust used this grant money to fund:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A rock and pop project in conjunction with the Royal Northern College of Music for 12 gifted young musicians which provided wonderful experiences, future music pathways and networking with industry professionals. 2. Free lessons for 15 weeks in Abermorddu, Bryn Deva, Caerwys, Leeswood, St David's High School, Ysgol Estyn and Ysgol Treffynnon. These were all schools that had tuition with us prior to COVID-19 but were either still having no tuition or a significant reduction on pre-COVID hours. Numbers of learners receiving tuition in these schools during this time was 165. Unfortunately continuation with the lessons was not sustained once the grant funding ceased to provide them free of charge. 																								
1.12	<p><u>National Plan for Music Education Wales</u></p> <p>Following the publication of a national report which outlined concerns about the demise of council music services across Wales due to funding pressures, and the negative impact this would have on children and young</p>																								

	<p>people's access to music tuition, and particularly those from disadvantaged backgrounds, Welsh Government responded positively.</p> <p>In May 2022 the National Plan for Music Education was announced with new money for music services across Wales - £13.5m over three years. The money allocated to Flintshire is approximately £230k per year to deliver on the key priorities within the national plan. There are 2 main strands;</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Music in schools 2. Music outside of schools <p>There are nine programmes of work underpinning the strands including First Experiences, music for lifelong learning, health and well-being and improving equity, diversity and inclusion.</p>
1.12	<p><u>First Experiences</u></p> <p>In October 2022 the 'First Experiences' offer started with its core aim to ensure that every child and young person has an equal opportunity to play, sing, take part in and create music in primary schools. It also contributes to improving the health and well-being of young people and driving equity, diversity and inclusion. The Theatr Clwyd First Experiences offer aims to give every Year 3 pupil free instrumental/vocal lessons and the Music Trust initially piloted plans in 9 schools - Ysgol Bryn Coch, Ysgol Bro Carmel, Golftyn, Mountain Lane, Queensferry, St John the Baptist, Wood Memorial, Ysgol Terrig and Ysgol Derwen. Nearly 200 Year 3 pupils have been participating in diverse, creative and exciting musical experiences. The pilot schools and pupils have really welcomed this project.</p> <p>Teachers <i>'We loved our First Experience session, the children were immediately engaged in the movement and 'hello' song'</i> <i>'The hall was alive with excitement as they explored their very own Cornet'</i> <i>'The buzz of excitement after the session carried on throughout the day ...'</i></p> <p>Pupils <i>'I've asked for a violin from Santa'</i> <i>'It has helped my confidence'</i> <i>'Cornet helps me to stay calm and relaxed'</i> <i>'I like how it makes me persevere'</i> <i>'It makes me feel like a champion'</i></p> <p>The full roll out has just started and more than 500 Year 3 pupils are receiving tuition for the rest of the academic year with more schools being encouraged to take up this free offer. The engagement with schools has meant that all the pupils in Year 3 are able to access high quality musical experiences regardless of their ability to pay.</p>
1.13	<p><u>Music Services for Pupils with Additional Learning Needs</u></p> <p>An area of strong progress for the Music Trust is working with children and young people who have Additional Learning Needs. Previously there was limited interaction with the secondary specialist school Ysgol Maes Hyfryd and none with the primary specialist school, Ysgol Pen Coch. The previous</p>

model also made it difficult to integrate and differentiate for learners with ALN in mainstream schools.

The Music Trust has employed a singing/piano teacher who has significant experience of working with children with ALN to deliver this enhanced offer. A training programme has also been developed to extend the skills of the rest of the Trust’s Music Team when they are working with ALN pupils. This current delivery is at no cost to special schools and families and the number of young people disclosing ALN and having small group and individual lessons is 70. Here is a report from one class teacher:

“We work with a student who has a complex condition that affects many areas of his life, including weakened muscles. This student spends parts of his day being taken out of class to support his other targets and often favours quiet time and his own company. However, whenever he hears music, he wants nothing more than to be involved. Music is an inclusive activity which brings him back into the world of his classmates and frees him from his inhibitions and stresses of his daily life.

He has individual guitar lessons that have been beneficial not only for his confidence, which he has displayed by performing in front of his classmates, but also for his fine motor skills. He has gone from being unable to hold a guitar unaided, to delicately finger picking notes and positioning his fingers on the correct strings, something that we did not know whether he would ever be able to do. This has been a transferable skill, improving his handwriting as he has more control of his fingers and strengthened muscles. His posture has also significantly improved from engaging his core when holding this guitar, another benefit that has become apparent in his everyday life.

In a world that can be challenging for some, music brings connection to those around you, enjoyment of the little things and a chance to learn new skills when it doesn't feel like learning. I have no doubt that music has benefitted all of the students in my class, but none more than this student who above all else, wants to be included and have fun.”

1.14 Live Music Experiences

Through our partnership with Theatr Clwyd and the Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama (RWCMD) we have been able to offer free concerts and shows in schools and offer discounted or free tickets to students to access some of the best of music in North Wales at venues including Theatr Clwyd and the newly acquired William Aston Hall. This supports the principles of equity of access for Flintshire children and young people to music events and promotes enjoyment, wellbeing and engagement.

Show	Price	Venue(s)	Attendees	Ages
Dionne Bennett, RWCMD Jazz – Blue Summer	Free	The ‘Mix’	22	14+

	Dionne Bennett, RWCMD Jazz – Blue Summer	Free	Flint High School, Castell Alun High School	350+	11 - 18
	'The Flying Bedroom'	Free	Ysgol Bryn Coch, Mountain Lane, Gwynedd CP, St Mary's Catholic Primary, St John the Baptist	650+	4 - 11
	Royal Welsh College of Music Brass Quintet	Free	Ysgol Estyn, Ysgol Derwen and Ysgol Glanrafon	500+	4 - 11
	Sinfonia Cymru	Free for student	William Aston Hall	55	7 +
	Strange Creatures	£4 (50% off)	The 'Mix'	53	4+
1.15	<p><u>Safeguarding</u></p> <p>Theatr Clwyd Music Trust takes seriously its responsibilities to keep people safe. All the team have safeguarding training regularly and all new members have training as part of their induction. A new policy is in the final stages of being ratified by Theatr Clwyd's safeguarding group, and given the significant amount of safeguarding expertise Theatr Clwyd team have through their partnership with Social Services, the safeguarding work for the Music Trust is the most robust it has ever been.</p>				
1.16	<p><u>The Future – the next two years</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop and implement the strategy to improve equity, diversity and inclusion. • Promote the benefits of learning an instrument especially the positive impact on health and well-being. • Increase the number of eFSM learners participating in musical activities. • Increase the number of learners in all schools, but especially within the school consortia of Connah's Quay, Holywell and Saltney. • Develop our work in Specialist Schools and other settings. • Work with maintained and non-maintained nursery settings to ensure that children from the age of 3 can start their journey in and through music. • Increase the number of live music experiences for all children and young people in Flintshire. • Working with schools to reduce their contribution to lessons; aiming to be cost neutral within the next three years. 				

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Continue to empower the team through regular professional development to work with the diverse communities in Flintshire.
--	---

2.00	RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS
2.01	No additional resource implications to Flintshire County Council.

3.00	IMPACT ASSESSMENT AND RISK MANAGEMENT														
3.01	<p>Service risks are recorded and monitored through the Music Service Trust's operational management processes and reported regularly to the Board of Trustees.</p> <p>The operations of the Music Trust make a significant contribution to Wales' Well-being Goals as outlined in the table below:</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td>Prosperous Wales</td> <td>n/a</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Resilient Wales</td> <td>n/a</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Healthier Wales</td> <td>Music is well documented as having a strong and positive impact on people's health and well-being.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>More equal Wales</td> <td>New model offers more equality of offer and cost across the county.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Cohesive Wales</td> <td>Music is seen as a way for people to connect, discuss, and understand other cultures and views.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vibrant Wales</td> <td>A vibrant Wales is one of music, and working towards all young people having access to learning it is vital.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Globally responsible Wales</td> <td>n/a</td> </tr> </table>	Prosperous Wales	n/a	Resilient Wales	n/a	Healthier Wales	Music is well documented as having a strong and positive impact on people's health and well-being.	More equal Wales	New model offers more equality of offer and cost across the county.	Cohesive Wales	Music is seen as a way for people to connect, discuss, and understand other cultures and views.	Vibrant Wales	A vibrant Wales is one of music, and working towards all young people having access to learning it is vital.	Globally responsible Wales	n/a
Prosperous Wales	n/a														
Resilient Wales	n/a														
Healthier Wales	Music is well documented as having a strong and positive impact on people's health and well-being.														
More equal Wales	New model offers more equality of offer and cost across the county.														
Cohesive Wales	Music is seen as a way for people to connect, discuss, and understand other cultures and views.														
Vibrant Wales	A vibrant Wales is one of music, and working towards all young people having access to learning it is vital.														
Globally responsible Wales	n/a														

4.00	CONSULTATIONS REQUIRED/CARRIED OUT
4.01	<p>To be carried out as follow up to 2019 consultations when the service model was changed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Secondary School Consultation Family Consultation Learner Consultation <p>Ongoing:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Primary School Consultation; Headteachers Federation and smaller delegation from Headteachers Federation Company Voice

5.00	APPENDICES
5.01	None.

6.00	LIST OF ACCESSIBLE BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS
6.01	<u>*National Plan for Music Education (gov.wales)</u>

7.00	CONTACT OFFICER DETAILS
7.01	Contact Officer: Aled Marshman, Director of Music, Theatr Clwyd Music Trust Aled.Marshman@theatrclywd.com

8.00	GLOSSARY OF TERMS
8.01	<p>Winter of Wellbeing: Welsh Government funding to support the social, emotional and physical wellbeing of children and young people 0 – 25 years.</p> <p>National Plan for Music Education Wales: Welsh Government plan to support the implementation of the Curriculum for Wales whilst providing a strategic and sustainable approach to ensure a diverse and equitable music education is accessible for our children and young people from ages 3 to 16.</p> <p>First Experiences: programme of work from National Plan for Music Education Wales. Developed with the aim of simultaneously inspiring children and young people and providing professional learning support to classroom practitioners.</p> <p>Live Music Experiences: programme of work from National Plan for Music Education Wales. Experience is an integral part of learning in the Expressive Arts. The experiential aspect of music is important for our children and young people to explore rich, authentic experiences in the Arts, both in and outside schools and settings to learn and celebrate music.</p> <p>Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama: our National conservatoire; it provides specialist practical and performance – based training in music and drama, enabling students to enter and influence the world of music, theatre and related professions.</p> <p>TUPE: Protection of employment rights when an organisation is transferred from one employer to another.</p>

	<p>Pupil Development Grant (PDG) – Funding from WG to schools on a per pupil basis to support the educational attainment of pupils entitled to Free School Meals where there is a greater risk of underachievement.</p>
--	--